



GREATER FARALLONES & CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARIES

JOINT ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Friday, February 24, 2023

9:00AM – 4:10PM

Dance Palace Community and Cultural Center and Virtual via Google Meet

MEETING HIGHLIGHTS

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS), Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS), or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

To view slides from any presentation referenced in this document, please email jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov.

Welcome, Roll Call, Review Agenda

GFNMS Advisory Council (GFNMSAC) Chair Abby Mohan and CBNMS Advisory Council (CBNMSAC) Acting Chair Jeff Dorman welcomed all to the meeting and called roll for both councils.

See Appendices I and II for council attendance records for this meeting.

GFNMS Advisory Council Business

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the December 2022 council meeting. Education member Bibit Traut motioned to approve the highlights and Conservation member Kathi George seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: Approve December 2022 meeting highlights

Vote: 11 yes, 0 no, 1 abstain

A copy of the meeting highlights is available upon request to jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov, and it will be posted online at https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_meetings.html.

The council then welcomed two new members. Bart Selby was sworn in as the Community-at-Large San Francisco/San Mateo member and Jenn Eckerle was sworn in as the California Natural Resources Agency member.

Action item: Joint Letter of Support for the Proposed Lake Ontario National Marine Sanctuary

Both councils reviewed a draft joint letter of support for the Proposed Lake Ontario National Marine Sanctuary. The councils suggested edits and additions to the letter. GFNMSAC Conservation member Francesca Koe motioned to approve the letter for the GFNMS Advisory Council. GFNMSAC Research member Jaime Jahncke seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for Proposed Lake Ontario National Marine Sanctuary

Vote: 12 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

CBNMSAC Research member Crissy Piotrowski motioned to approve the letter for the CBNMS Advisory Council. CBNMSAC Community-at-Large Sonoma County member Steve Tubbs seconded.

CBNMSAC MOTION: Approve Joint Letter of Support for Proposed Lake Ontario National Marine Sanctuary

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

Action item: GFNMS Advisory Council Vessel Incidents Subcommittee: Non-regulatory Recommendations

Cea Higgins, Chair of the GFNMS Advisory Council Vessel Incidents Subcommittee, walked the council through the non-regulatory recommendations of the subcommittee. The council discussed and suggested edits to the recommendations.

Commercial Fishing member Sarah Bates inquired if the U.S. Coast Guard was consulted on the recommendations. Francesca Koe added that the GFNMSAC U.S. Coast Guard member and alternate were absent. Cea informed the council that the U.S. Coast Guard was engaged during various community forums regarding the *F/V Seastar*.

Community-At-Large Marin County alternate Richard James noted that increased communication would be key. He recalled that when the *American Challenger* incident took place, officials reached out to him for contact information. Commercial Fishing alternate Richard Ogg echoed this and encouraged a coordinated response to vessel incidents amongst all relevant agencies. Cea noted that these non-regulatory recommendations were a first step in beginning a dialogue in this direction.

Superintendent Maria Brown noted that the sanctuaries do have a Standard Operating Procedure in place for vessel responses. The challenge is that there are so many agencies that respond to these types of incidents with varying degrees of jurisdictional authority. She highlighted that the U.S. Coast Guard has the authority when there are concerns for life and for oil removal. The sanctuaries have the authority to remove vessels, but we do not have the funds. The State has the authority to remove vessels but only has funds for recreational vessels and only when on state lands.

Education alternate Mary Miller inquired if the National Transportation Safety Board was brought into the subcommittee's conversations. Cea responded that the subcommittee reached out to many outside organizations, but that participation depended on availability.

Cea mentioned that GFNMS was not mentioned at all within local county emergency response plans to which Superintendent Brown said she would bring up at an upcoming Regional Response Team meeting.

Following discussion, Community-at-Large Marin County member George Clyde put forward a motion for the council to adopt the non-regulatory recommendations, with the suggested edits from the council, of the Vessel Incidents Subcommittee. Maritime Commercial Activities member John Berge seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: To adopt the non-regulatory recommendations of the Vessel Incidents Subcommittee

Vote: 13 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

GFNMS and CBNMS Superintendent's Report

Maria Brown, Superintendent of GFNMS and CBNMS, provided updates on GFNMS and CBNMS Operations, Research, Education/Outreach, and Resource Protection program activities since the last council meetings in November and December.

Highlights included 1) the announcement of NOAA's Marine and Coastal Area-based Management Advisory Committee, 2) the expansion of the Area To Be Avoided west and south of Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary by the International Maritime Organization, 3) the return of GFNMS/CBNMS staff to Southeast Farallon Island to conduct rocky intertidal monitoring, 4) an update that the CBNMS Condition Report was being prepared for final formatting and the GFNMS Condition Report was out for expert review, and 5) an overview of a comment letter sent by GFNMS/CBNMS and MBNMS to the Pacific Fisheries Management Council regarding Non-Trawl Rockfish Conservation Areas.

Superintendent Brown also highlighted that four vessel incidents had occurred since the last council meeting.

Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary Superintendent's Report

Lisa Wooninck, Superintendent of Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), provided a brief report on recent and upcoming events at the sanctuary.

Highlights included 1) enforcement coordination regarding black abalone poaching with NOAA Office of Law Enforcement and the Monterey County District Attorney's Office, 2) the Monterey City Council's vote to discontinue city service to visiting cruise ships, 3) MBNMS Sanctuary Exploration Center participation in the City of Santa Cruz's First Friday events, and 5) the MBNMS Advisory Council's recent recommendation to join the voluntary vessel speed reduction program.

John Berge inquired if the Monterey City Council's vote to discontinue cruise ship services was based on environmental concerns. Lisa informed John that she understood the council was concerned with the risk of potential discharge incidents from cruise ships.

Richard James inquired if black abalone poaching was associated at all with Caltrans side casting. Lisa informed Richard that she was unable to comment on the matter, however she highlighted that recent storms may be causing sediment flows into the sanctuary which may impact abalone. She emphasized that this is a natural occurrence.

GFNMSAC California Natural Resources Agency member Jenn Eckerle informed the councils that there was a State vessel speed reduction bill introduced (California AB953) that, if passed, would require the Ocean Protection Council to develop and implement a sustainable shipping program.

Public Comment

Eileen Boken, Coalition for San Francisco Neighborhoods: “[Comment pertained to] GFNMS Management Plan Review and potential expansion to include non-contiguous area of waters off San Francisco's Ocean Beach.”

Greg Helms, Ocean Conservancy: “It will be important in the Management Plan review to connect key SAC goals (bottom habitat protection, vessel strikes, etc.) with regulations current and proposed, and the terms of designation to identify pathways and limitations to advancing Sanctuary conservation. The scope of regulatory authority available for use by the Sanctuary, and options for expanding it to meet current and foreseeable resource challenges, should be included in the Management Plan review.”

Jack Gescheidt, In Defense of Animals: “As a representative of In Defense of Animals, we have concerns and questions about the proposed rodenticide treatment program [on the Farallon Islands proposed by the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service].”

Action item: Deep Sea Benthic Habitat

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on Deep Sea Benthic Habitat work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan.

Following the presentations, the councils engaged in a discussion with sanctuary staff. Francesca Koe asked staff if they could elaborate on the Pacific Fishery Management Council (PFMC) comment letter sent by GFNMS, CBNMS, and MBNMS regarding Non-trawl Rockfish Conservation Areas (NT-RCA). Staff responded by stating that NT-RCAs currently overlap with GFNMS and MBNMS identified sites for coral restoration within the *Draft Restoration Plan and NEPA Evaluation for the YFD-70 Drydock* (to view the plan, visit <https://nmsfarallones.blob.core.windows.net/farallones-prod/media/docs/20221206-draft-yfd-70-restoration-plan-and-nepa-eval.pdf>). These NT-RCAs are currently being considered to be reopened by the PFMC.

Sarah Bates and Dick Ogg provided context for both the commercial and recreational rockfish fisheries, and why they are being considered for reopening. They mentioned that these NT-RCAs are being examined for reopening based on data that rockfish populations in these areas are recovering. They emphasized that these areas would be important areas for fishing for those who cannot participate in the salmon fishery.

Bitib Traut highlighted the need to better define “deep sea habitat” versus “deep sea benthic habitat.

George Clyde inquired as to why hypoxia was not covered in this particular presentation to which Superintendent Brown replied that hypoxia would be covered during an upcoming meeting focused on water quality.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. For the GFNMS Advisory Council, Jaime Jahncke motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. George Clyde seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Deep Sea Benthic Habitat Topic Briefing

Vote: 11 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

While providing her vote, Sarah Bates stated that she supported these recommendations with the caveat that the sanctuaries coordinate with the PFMC versus attempting to regulate fisheries. Bibit Traut stated that she supported the recommendations with the caveat that deep sea benthic habitat is better defined moving forward.

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit
https://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/sac_actions.html

For the CBNMS Advisory Council, Community-at-Large Sonoma County member Frank Capurro motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. Chrissy Piotrowski seconded.

CBNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Deep Sea Benthic Habitat Topic Briefing

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

To view the recommendations within the topic briefing, please visit
<https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/actions.html>

Action item: Marine Mammals/Whales

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014 on marine mammals and whales. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan.

Following the presentations, the councils engaged in discussion with sanctuary staff. Kathi George inquired if incorporating the San Francisco-Pacific Exclusion Zone into the sanctuary systems was being considered as a potential way to increase marine mammal protection.

Superintendent Brown informed the council that sanctuary staff had not yet discussed the exclusion zone, but that this would be the time to discuss the matter. Abby Mohan highlighted that the GFNMSAC has already recommended that GFNMS/CBNMS examine the feasibility of incorporating the exclusion zone non-contiguously into GFNMS. Superintendent Brown recommended that the council revisit the discussion at an upcoming meeting (potentially the meeting focused on open ocean), and that ONMS Director John Armor has asked her to discuss

the matter with MBNMS Superintendent Lisa Wooninck if GFNMS moves forward with considering inclusion of the exclusion zone.

GFNMS/CBNMS staff clarified the difference between observed ship strikes to whales and modeling that demonstrates the likely number of whales actually struck by ships, but which are not observed (i.e., they do not wash up along the coast).

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. For the GFNMS Advisory Council, Francesca Koe motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. Jaime Jahncke seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Marine Mammal/Whales Topic Briefing

Vote: 10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

For the CBNMS Advisory Council, Steve Tubbs motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. Chrissy Piotrowski seconded.

CBNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Marine Mammal/Whales Topic Briefing

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

Action item: Seabirds and Shorebirds

GFNMS/CBNMS staff provided a comprehensive presentation on work that has taken place since the last management plan review in 2014 on marine mammals and whales. The presentations included information on resource protection, conservation science, and education activities as well as staff recommendations for activities for the next management plan.

Following presentations, the councils engaged in discussion with sanctuary staff on the topic. Bart Selby voiced support for a future meeting agenda item focused on potential seabird and shorebird entanglements from municipal fishing piers and where the issue may be mitigated with increased education efforts.

Francesca Koe highlighted that pier fishing is where many historically marginalized Californian families with fewer resources than other recreational users go to spend time, so any outreach or education materials should be provided in a few different languages to accommodate the diversity of communities.

Following discussion, the councils made edits and additions to staff recommendations. For the GFNMS Advisory Council, Bibit Traut motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. Kathi George seconded.

GFNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Seabirds and Shorebirds Topic Briefing

Vote: 10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

For the CBNMS Advisory Council, Conservation member Morgan Patton motioned to support the edited staff recommendations. Conservation member Scott Artis seconded.

CBNMSAC MOTION: To support the staff recommendations within the Seabirds and Shorebirds Topic Briefing

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstain

CBNMS Advisory Council Business

The council approved the draft meeting highlights from the November 2022 council meeting. Steve Tubbs motioned to approve the highlights and Scott Artis seconded.

CBNMSAC MOTION: Approve December 2022 meeting highlights

Vote: 6 yes, 0 no, 1 abstain

A copy of the meeting highlights is available upon request to jordan.gorostiza@noaa.gov, and it will be posted online at <https://cordellbank.noaa.gov/council/documents.html>.

Member and Alternate Reports

See Appendix III for member and alternate reports.

Meeting highlights prepared by Jordan Gorostiza, Advisory Council Coordinator.

Appendix I. GFNMSAC Attendance for the February 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting

Name	Seat	Attendance
Sarah Bates	Commercial Fishing (Member)	Y
Richard Ogg	Commercial Fishing (Alternate)	Y
George Clyde	Community-at-Large Marin (Member)	Y
Richard James	Community-at-Large Marin (Alternate)	Y
Cea Higgins	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Member)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large Mendocino-Sonoma (Alternate)	--
Bart Selby	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Member)	Y
Vacant	Community-at-Large San Francisco-San Mateo (Alternate)	--
Francesca Koe	Conservation (Member)	Y
Kathi George	Conservation (Member)	Y
Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--

Vacant	Conservation (Alternate)	--
Bibit Traut	Education (Member)	Y
Mary Miller	Education (Alternate)	Y
John Berge	Maritime Commercial Activities (Member)	Y
Julian Rose	Maritime Commercial Activities (Alternate)	Y
Abby Mohan	Maritime Recreational Activities (Member)	Y
Vacant	Maritime Recreational Activities (Alternate)	--
Jaime Jahncke	Research (Member)	Y
Ellen Hines	Research (Alternate)	Y
Vacant	Youth (Member)	--
Vacant	Youth (Alternate)	--
Jenn Eckerle	California Department of Natural Resources (Member)	Y

Michael Esgro	California Department of Natural Resources (Alternate)	Y
Craig Kenkel	National Park Service (Member)	Y
Ben Becker	National Park Service (Alternate)	N
LT Lelea Lingo	U.S. Coast Guard (Member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	U.S. Coast Guard (Alternate)	N
Matthew Brown	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Member)	Y
Gerry McChesney	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Alternate)	N
Jennifer Boyce	National Marine Fisheries Service (Member)	Y
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Alternate)	--
Chris Mobley	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	N
Mike Murray	Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Member)	Y
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Alternate)	N

Appendix II. CBNMSAC Attendance for the February 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting

Name	Seat	Attendance
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Vacant	Community-at-Large Marin	--
Frank Capurro	Community-at-Large Sonoma	Y
Steve Tubbs	Community-at-Large Sonoma	Y
Scott Artis	Conservation	Y
Morgan Patton	Conservation	Y
Vacant	Education	--
Vacant	Education	--
Vacant	Fishing	--
Vacant	Fishing	--
Vacant	Maritime Activities	--

Kai Martin (Chair)	Maritime Activities	N
Jeff Dorman	Research	Y
Chrissy Piotrowski	Research	Y
Lisa Wooninck	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting member)	Y
Dawn Hayes	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (Non-voting alternate)	N
LT Kynan Barrios	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting member)	N
Vacant	National Marine Fisheries Service (Non-voting alternate)	--
LT Lelea Lingo	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting member)	N
LTJG Andrew Kang	United States Coast Guard (Non-voting alternate)	N

Appendix III. Written Member Reports of the CBNMSAC for the February 2023 GFNMS/CBNMS Advisory Council Meeting

Name: Morgan Patton

Seat: Cordell Bank, Marin County, Conservation

Report:

- **Cleaner CA Coast Campaign:** Marin, Sonoma, and Mendocino Counties are partnered with [Leave No Trace](#), visitor's bureaus, community stakeholders, and nonprofits to launch an education initiative that encourages all of us to practice [Leave No Trace](#) when spending time in coastal communities across Marin, Sonoma, and Mendocino Counties. Specific audiences for the initiative include day users, overnight visitors, and coastal residents who spend time outdoors. EAC is a primary partner of this initiative and has created a [visitor stewardship guide](#) and social media toolkit that will be distributed to partners and stakeholders to use positive messaging to promote responsible recreation and visitation. We are seeking additional partnerships as the campaign moves from planning to implementation in June 2023. Contact Morgan at EAC for more information on how to become a partner. Specifically, the project would love to have the Sanctuary team engaged in the next 6 months.
- **Duxbury Docents Training:** EAC is currently training our second cohort of docents to provide outreach and education along Duxbury Reef. We have a fantastic group of residents from Bolinas and frequent visitors to the reef who joined the training program. Three of our new docents joined the program after they encountered docents on the reef in 2022 and wanted to get involved. The 2023 training continues through the middle of March.

2022 (last year) Docent Program Highlights

- 11 volunteers trained (January - February 2022) on reef ecology, flora and fauna, intertidal zonation, anthropogenic impacts, tidepool etiquette, docent protocols, and regulations of California Marine Protected Areas over five days. A big thanks to our expert instructors including Kathy Ann Miller (U.C. Berkeley), Rebecca Johnson (California Academy of Sciences), Joe Mueller (College of Marin), and Kent Khtikian (Rocky Shore Intertidal Naturalist, California Academy of Sciences).
- 61 shift reports and MPA Watch surveys submitted.
- 975 visitors engaged on reef ecology, MPAs, and tidepool etiquette.
- 30 instances where docents helped visitors avoid violation of MPA regulations through education.
- 10 large-group education engagements on tidepool protection and etiquette
- **California MPA 10-Year Report and Public Engagement:** The California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) released the first-ever review of the MPA

network in their report, [*California Marine Protected Area Decadal Management Review*](#). The report reviews the last 10 years of research and monitoring; outreach and education; policy and permitting; and enforcement and compliance activities. It also provides the public with information and recommendations for the future to address knowledge gaps and changing environmental and socioeconomic conditions. A public forum will be held in Monterey on March 15th and a Fish and Game Commission Meeting on March 16th. Learn more about the public forum and Fish and Game Commission meeting [here](#).

- **EAC's Educational Office Exhibit:** This exhibit features the conservation stories of some of the iconic and ecologically significant areas in West Marin that are also part of the GFNMS, Duxbury Reef, Tomales Bay, and Bolinas Lagoon, and more. The exhibit is open to the public Fridays and Saturdays 12pm-4pm. [Learn More](#)

Relevant links and/or media: See blue hyperlinks above.

Name: Christina Piotrowski

Seat: Cordell Bank, Research

Report:

- In January 2023, [a major revision of the Order Axinellida \(Porifera\)](#) published by Turner and Pankey in Zootaxa included a species description for a new species of sponge collected on Cordell Bank in 1940. The species is named *Halicnemia weltoni* after Academy sponge curator Welton Lee, who initially identified the specimen as a provisional species in 1998. UC Santa Barbara Faculty and first author, [Thomas Turner](#), frequently accesses the Academy's research collections for Porifera research.
- In celebration of the 50th Anniversary of the National Marine Sanctuary Program, the Naturalist Center on the public floor of the California Academy of Sciences is currently exhibiting [a magnification station](#) featuring a sediment sample and benthic invertebrate specimens from Cordell Bank beneath a CBNMS 50th Anniversary poster. Museum guests can view the sediment through magnifiers alongside larger specimens representing a few of the invertebrate species fragments visible in the sediment (see images linked above). Engagement in this area of the Academy reached more than 19,000 monthly visitors during peak holiday months and our guests continue to actively engage with the mini-exhibit, according to Naturalist Center staff.
- The Academy also plans to partner with the Oakland Museum this coming quarter by lending their exhibit team several research specimens collected by Robert Schmieder and team during the Cordell Expeditions of the 1970's and 1980's to include in their Cordell Bank exhibit.

Relevant links and/or media:

Name: Steve Tubbs

Seat: Sonoma County Community at Large

Report: I have nothing to share from the Sonoma County community at large at this time.

I continue to share National Marine Sanctuary (in general), NOAA Fisheries, and CBNMS, GFNMS and MBNMS (specific) information with my Facebook contacts and groups. I also share Cordell Bank and Greater Farallones information with the various hiking groups that I am involved with, especially when we are hiking the Marin County and Sonoma County coasts. Again, I find many people who are unaware of these marine sanctuaries, so this is an opportunity to educate them as we enjoy the beauty of nature. Our discussions often involve whales, pinnipeds and birds and sometimes issues that someone may have heard about through others.

The Russian River Fly Fishers continue to sponsor the Steelhead in the Classroom program with Sonoma County Water Agency and CDFW. We have a number of new classrooms involved this year. The Russian River Wild Steelhead Society also continues to sponsor Steelhead in the Classroom for classrooms in the Russian River communities. Fish counts on the Russian River have been low this year, but thankfully the January storms have had a significant impact on the water supply in the Russian River watershed.

I continue to advertise my association with the CBNMSAC and to request my constituents to contact me with questions or information.