

# GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS) ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Golden Gate National Recreation Area Headquarters Upper Fort Mason Bldg 201 San Francisco, CA Thursday, August 23, 2012 9:15 – 4:00

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

# CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA

Copies to:

Bill Douros ONMS West Coast Regional Office

Richard Charter called the meeting to order at 9:30

# **Review Agenda**

Staff introductions

Swearing-in of new members: Noelle Kitenko, Cat Kuhlman and Clare O'Reilly

## **Superintendent's Report:**

The Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) is celebrating its 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary and will be doing a countdown of its top 40 accomplishments.

## Campaign of Engagement-

The ONMS goal is to increase protection at sanctuaries and to see increased areas protected as sanctuaries within the next 15 years. Each sanctuary site will be working on a special project to raise awareness and appreciation for sanctuaries. The GFNMS project is to engage in a public process to include the San Francisco-Pacifica Exclusion Area into the Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS).

#### Permits-

A research permit was issued to Bill Carmen for Bolinas Lagoon Restoration on Kent Island. Activities include invasive vegetation removal and native species planting, to restore the island natural ecological processes. The permit includes placement of a structure to flood the island with salt water.

A research permit was issued to Carl Kammerer to place five buoys within GFNMS and MBNMS for current and oceanographic observations.



A research permit was issued to Tessa Hill to demarcate eelgrass bed sampling grids to investigate the role of eelgrass beds in modifying water chemistry, particularly in the context of reductions in pH due to ocean acidification.

An education permit was issued to Chris Duba, of Silver Fox Sportfishing and Tours to use decoys to attract white sharks during ecotourism tours for the general public. No cages will be used.

An education permit was issued to James Moskito, of Great White Adventures, to use decoys to attract white sharks, for the purpose of educational tourism and filming, which is an extension of the permit issued in 2011. The conditions include that they are not allowed to attract or approach white sharks using mobile cages to view white sharks.

Additionally there are three permits under review: (1) David Marks, for a 3D film on white sharks; (2) Jane Reifert, of Incredible Adventures; and (3) Barbara Block, from Stanford University.

## **International Activities-**

International Maritime Organization (IMO) Update

NOAA worked very closely with the USCG over the past year to look at the existing shipping lanes outside SF Bay and to recommend changes to those lanes that will not only ensure safety of navigation but will also keep large commercial ships farther away from fishing grounds to reduce the likelihood of collision with commercial fishing boats; keep large commercial ships farther away from the Farallon islands and Cordell Bank, providing a buffer for vessels that may lose steerage or allow more time for oil spill response; keep vessels farther away from Areas of Special Biological Significance, such as the ASBS's off Bolinas Lagoon, Pt Reyes and Farallon Islands, and; safely and efficiently guide commercial vessels over the continental shelf edge to reduce the impact of shipping on endangered whale feeding grounds. The Joint Working Group (JWG) on Vessel Strikes and Acoustic Impacts played an important role in shaping these recommendations

In early July, NOAA presented the recommendations for San Francisco, Los Angeles/Long Beach and Santa Barbara Channel on behalf of the US government to a working group of the IMO. Those recommendations were then forwarded to the Safety of Navigation Subcommittee, which accepted the recommendations and approved the three Traffic Separation Scheme (TSS) proposals. This November, the Maritime Safety Committee will receive the recommendations and determine whether to adopt the recommendations. NOAA looks forward to working with the USCG on implementation and outreach to the shipping industry.

# Sister Sanctuaries

The Sanctuary has been working to improve trans-boundary management of highly migratory species, like whales and sharks, through international partnerships. The sanctuary recently hosted a summer intern from Carnegie Mellon (Alice Tripp) with experience and training in Conservation Planning, International Relations and fluent Spanish language skills. Alice worked



with the NOAA International Program to identify international marine protected areas along the west coast of North and Central America that share resource protection issues with West Coast Region Sanctuary sites. Her work resulted in:

- o A first draft of a joint action plan between Guadalupe Island in Mexico and GFNMS to form a sister sanctuary and collaborate on white shark conservation
- A better understanding of blue and humpback whale "hotspots" in the Eastern Pacific and recommendations for regional partnerships between the United States, Mexico and Central America to better protect whales in their feeding, breeding and calving grounds

## Additional international activities include:

- Karen Reyna was invited to Japan to present our seabird conservation actions from the Seabird Protection Network
- Kelley Higgason went to Vietnam to participate in a climate change in MPA's workshop
- Carol Preston went to both Korea and Turkey for workshops on how to implement MPAs
- Maria Brown travelled to Canada for a workshop with the Commission on Environmental Cooperation on guidelines for MPA managers to address climate change
- GFNMS also hosted the ONMS International Marine Protected Area Manager summit
- A Chilean delegation will be coming to the California Sanctuaries in the coming month to learn about MPA management in the US.

## Essential Fish Habitat Update

GFNMS is still participating in the Pacific Fisheries Management Council Essential Fish Habitat Process. We are on the advisory committee for the EFH review and most recently we have been assisting the Council with data collection for the EFH report. Today the Pacific Fishery Management Council is releasing that report. It informs the Council of significant changes in knowledge since the last EFH review was completed in 2006. While the report will not include a comprehensive analysis of data to develop alternatives, examples of applications of new information are provided to demonstrate their utility and set priorities. The Council will be discussing and possibly adopting the report at their September meeting in Boise, Idaho. The sanctuary ensured that the report contains all the new scientific information gathered in this region, including the new multi-beam data that was presented at our last Advisory Council Meeting, which is in the report.

The status of the EFH process is that everything is delayed to allow for more analysis of the information in the report. The National Marine Fisheries Service Northwest Fisheries Science Center plans to synthesize information in the Report from now until April 2013. The Sanctuary will be reviewing the information in the report during this time as well and will be using some of this information to identify targets for Remote Operating Vehicle (ROV) work planned for early October. Once GFNMS completes our cruise, it is planning to start discussing how to engage with the Pacific Fishery Management Council and the National Marine Fisheries Service leading up to the April Council meeting. GFNMS also plans to meet with fishermen and other interested stakeholders as early as late October/early November. If the Pacific Fishery Management Council (PFMC) takes any action on considering modifications to current EFH conservation



areas, the earliest they will initiate that process is late summer 2013. Request for Proposals for new EFH areas will not be due until at least the June 2013 PFMC meeting. Please visit prouncil.org if you want a copy of the report, which contains the full timeline and explanation of process.

# **Monterey Bay Superintendents Report**

Please see <a href="http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/120816/120815sacoff.pdf">http://montereybay.noaa.gov/sac/2012/120816/120815sacoff.pdf</a> for a report on what's new at MBNMS

# **Cordell Bank Superintendents Report**

Please see <a href="http://cordellbank.noaa.gov/">http://cordellbank.noaa.gov/</a> for updates on what's new at CBNMS

# **Member Reports**

Bob Breen-

Bob recently attended a Marine Protected Area (MPA) state-wide conference. The purpose of the conference was to coordinate MPA programs across the state. MPA Watch is a citizen science program that collects data on MPAs. MPA Watch has the goal of a central database with standard protocols. If anyone wants to join a committee, talk to Bob.

California Academy of Sciences had a three-day Bio-Blitz in June at Pillar Point. The event was essentially a species richness survey run by Alison Young of the Academy.

Also, the Half Moon Bay Review has a monthly magazine and they are doing a special on MPAs.

#### Bruce Bowser-

The tsunami debris surveys have begun and are providing some very interesting information thus far.

The Kent Island Restoration is underway as officially announced by Marin County. There is a 30 day public review on the finding of no significant impact of the restoration.

#### Jaime Jahncke-

Jaime proposed two presentations for the November council meeting: one on shipping lanes/whales interactions, and nesting birds of the Farallon Islands.

ACCESS surveys have been ongoing this summer. June and July cruises are complete and there is another coming in September. Jaime reported sightings of large numbers of whales so far.

# George Clyde-

George gave an update on his KWMR stories and mentioned that it has been a great year for recreational salmon fishing.



# Dominique Richard-

The National Academy of Sciences DEIS for the Special Use permit for Drakes has been released.

# Bradley Soule-

LT Soule introduced himself as the USCG District 11 LMR Officer.

#### Richard Charter-

Richard mentioned a bill that had recently passed the House of Representatives allowing drilling in three CA lease areas.

## Cat Kuhlman-

Cat introduced herself and her work in CA Resources Agency. She brings together the resource team for oceans with the Ocean Protection Council (OPC). She is also Executive Director of OPC.

California's Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) baseline monitoring programs are all being led by the MPA Monitoring Enterprise, which is part of the Ocean Science Trust (OST). Cat offered at the next meeting to give presentation on MPA Monitoring Enterprise.

The National Academy of Sciences just published a report to look at sea level rise across the west coast of United States. In brief summary, from Cape Mendocino south will be hit harder than the northern coast.

There will be an OPC meeting on Sept 13 in Sacramento.

## Kellyx Nelson -

The San Mateo Resource Conservation District (RCD), sanctuaries, and the Golden Gate National Recreation Area are sharing Americorps interns for salmonid restoration work and outreach/education work.

The RCD is working with partners to establish a set of Best Management Practices in the south bay to improve water quality from livestock and equestrian operations in the sanctuary (manure management).

A report on microbial source tracking at Pillar Point Harbor should be available soon from the RCD.

The regional Water Quality Control Board in Pescadero is developing Total Maximum Daily Loads for sediment.

The State of California Parks and Fish and Game are putting together a science panel regarding management of Pescadero Marsh.



There is a great outdoors initiative under National Resource Conservation Service is committed to allocating farm bill conservation dollars to improve water quality in draining into Monterey Sanctuary.

## Tim Duff –

A volunteer-based life rescue group met with the sheriff's department to discuss development of a rescue training program using jet skis in Half Moon Bay and Mavericks.

The video production company making the Maverick's film did not have permit to film in and around Mavericks, so a settlement is underway with the production company and hoping to get funds from the settlement to have more resources for enforcement.

# Barbara Emley-

Barbara received exempted fishing permit to look at whether fishing can happen in the rock fish area, starting in 2013.

## Bob Wilson -

Northern fur seals on the beaches of Oahu were sent out to the Marine Mammal Center (MMC) in Sausalito and will be released in Point Reyes next week.

A MMC facility for monk seals on the Big Island in Hawaii will be opening up soon.

There has been an increase this season in sea lion shootings. Harbor seals have had a good year, with rehabilitation success rate the highest they have ever had.

The Farallones Marine Sanctuary Association (FMSA) is looking for a new Executive Director. The role of FMSA in sanctuary staffing is changing and has been the lead in providing detail work, contracts and resources for sanctuary projects.

#### Peter Grenell-

A site in Pillar Point Harbor has been approved to incorporate a multi-purpose building that will also include offices and other facilities, including perhaps the Farallones San Mateo Coast Visitors Center.

Pillar Point Harbor has been working with Carol Preston at GFNMS on a sanctuary harbor district public information signpost to be erected in the harbor.

The Harbor District was approached by a Smithsonian research group dealing with the andaria problem (invasive vegetation coming from Asia on ships) and they will be doing preventative research on this issue.

The Harbor District is working with fish and game on rehabilitation pens to help oiled sea otters.



For king salmon runs, thousands of smolts deposited in pens in the harbor earlier this year to bypass the hazards smolts face coming down the Sacramento river, has been successful and will continue next year.

The San Mateo Harbor District will be celebrating its 80<sup>th</sup> anniversary in 2013.

The Harbor District approved a permit to use certain selected harbor district facilities and services for the Mavericks surf event as a festival area with a jumbotron screen and use for parking, etc. There will be no direct viewing of the event and no access to bluffs.

# John Bradley -

The US Fish and Wildlife Service is currently in phase one of south bay salt pond project. The process is 4 months behind but is moving forward to the satisfaction of the Army Corps of Engineers and flood control.

USFWS is looking for a new outreach and education staff member.

#### Frank Dean-

Oct is the 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Golden Gate National Recreation Area (GGNRA), there are two new visitors centers: one near The Cliff House and another at the Golden Gate Bridge Visitor area.

The Americas Cup is underway and the compliance and permits are completed.

Restoration and maintenance work at streams near Mt. Tam (moving dikes, trails and parking) has been very successful.

Rapid erosion occurs near Sloat Blvd, at Ocean Beach (near the water treatment plant and the zoo) so sediment/sand is being transported there so in the next few weeks an additional 60ft of beach will be established and help prolong the life of the facilities there. However, there is a still a need to figure out a long term plan.

In partnership with San Mateo County, the devil slide tunnel will open in December/January.

## **BREAK**

# **Advisory Council Business**

# **Approval of June Meeting Notes**

Motion to approve the June 2012 Key Meeting Outcomes:

Motion: Barbara Emley Second: Dominique Richard

Vote: Two abstentions, all rest in favor

# **Approval of SAC Charter Amendment (Youth Seat)**



# Motion to adopt SAC Charter Amendment, as written:

Motion: Bob Breen

Second: Catherine Kuhlman

Vote: None opposed

Youth involvement subcommittee and Leslie will be working in the next month to get a recruitment including asking the SAC members how to do outreach for a potential members.

SAC West Coast Region Quarterly Report -

Please see the newsletter at:

http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr\_q2\_2012.pdf

## Retreat Plan –

This year, the SAC planning retreat will be at the Cypress Grove Research Center on Tomales Bay. The SAC will review this past year as well as priorities for next year. Then, the council will go to Hog Island Oyster Company for a tour and celebration.

## SAC Challenge 2012-

We will be reviewing the contributions of individual SAC members at the planning retreat in October.

# Nominations for Officers-

At the October planning retreat, the SAC will elect new officers.

Nominations:

Bob Wilson nominates Dominique Richard for chair, Barbara Emley seconds Barbara Emley nominates herself as Secretary, Bob Wilson seconds Bob Breen nominates Barbara Emley for Chair, Kellyx Nelson seconds

Richard Charter nominates Bob Wilson for Vice Chair, Barbara Emley seconds

George Clyde nominates Dominique for Vice Chair, Bruce Bowser seconds

The SAC agreed to have more nominations over email, if necessary.

# <u>Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan Release</u> (Karen Reyna)

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12 08/tbvmp ppt.pdf

# **LUNCH**

# **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Name: Amy Chastain

**Affiliation:** San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC)

Introduction and invitation to tour the SFPUC

Name: Brenda Donald Affiliation: SFPUC



Prior to my employment I was the chair of the GFNMS Advisory Council working group that evaluated the San Francisco-Pacifica Exclusion Area. I support including this area into the sanctuary. This would be an opportunity for the sanctuary to partner with cities andreach out to communities, as well as develop strong ecotourism in the area. Dredge materials in the area are clean and needed for Ocean Beach replenishment. The water quality from the Southwest Ocean Outfall is good.

Name: David Vespremi

**<u>Affiliation:</u>** Resident of Moss Beach

The community needs more educational outreach for visitors to Fitzgerald Marine Reserve, such as signage, etc. The reef is being loved to death. David and his father have been working on an interactive program that could be used to teach school-age programs to kids. David asked us to look at the IPad app they developed.

<u>Name:</u> Sabrina Brennan <u>Affiliation:</u> Critical Area 29

I wanted to bring up the Perch Beach project. She wanted to know whether a letter of intent has been issued for GFNMS to occupy a building in the Harbor District. Additional concerns with parking issues.

Superintendent Maria Brown responded that GFNMS does not have a letter of intent regarding a Visitor Center in Pillar Point Harbor. The SAC did have a working group which created a concept plan, but GFNMS cannot commit to anything at this time due to funding constraints.

Name: Laslo Vsepremi

**Affiliation:** Resident of Moss Landing

Harassment of wildlife at Fitzgerald Marine Reserve is a problem, especially in regards to low overflights. The Half Moon Bay airport has an annual 2 day "demolition derby", which is an activity that should be moved to another location.

Karen Reyna (GFNMS) responded that there are currently no overflight restrictions in the area, but there are wildlife disturbance prohibitions. The Seabird Protection Network can address these issues.

Brad Soule reminded the public to please report violations to NOAA Office of Law Enforcement, US Coast Guard and Cal Fish and Game.

Tim Duff, in response to Brenda Donald's comment stated that he would like to go on record as supporting the inclusion of the donut hole into the sanctuary.

# <u>Site Evaluation List Letter (Possible Council Action)</u> (Richard Charter)

Richard Charter gave an introduction and history of the SEL

Superintendent Maria Brown explained that the SEL is an internal NOAA process by which the agency may begin to consider a site for sanctuary designation.



# Motion to send letter supporting reactivation of SEL to NOAA Administrator and Secretary of Commerce

First: Bob Wilson Second: Bob Breen

**Discussion:** The SAC had a discussion of various areas that are looking at expansion versus new

sanctuaries. They also discussed the differences between sanctuaries and monuments.

**Vote:** None opposed. No abstentions.

Letter available at: <a href="http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/sel\_letter\_final\_2012.pdf">http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/sel\_letter\_final\_2012.pdf</a>

# Boundary Adjustment- San Francisco Pacifica Exclusion Area (Possible Council Action)

(Emma Freeman, Cameron Gray, Leslie Abramson)

Presentation available at: <a href="http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/bren\_ppt.pdf">http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/bren\_ppt.pdf</a>

Discussion: The council recommended the Bren students examine the following issues:

- GFNMS and CBNMS language in designation document regarding vessel traffic
- Concerns of the commercial fishing fleet
- The creation of scenarios
- Socio-economic analysis
- Including a strong scientific analysis

Leslie Abramson (GFNMS) gave information on the public scoping meetings and NOAA timeline for the project

**Discussion** on SAC resolution to support the inclusion of San Francisco-Pacifica Exclusion Area into MBNMS:

Bob Wilson stated that during this scoping process, GFNMS should consider changing the boundary change as an expansion of GFNMS (not MBNMS).

Kellyx Nelson suggested that it may be better to go under MBNMS jurisdiction because by being under MBNMS there are several funding sources that can go toward conservation and protection measures/projects. Kellyx also suggests not doing two things at once: maybe just support the resolution and at a later time consider adding it to GFNMS.

Barbara Emley stated that commercial fishers will likely not support the resolution if it is considered under MBNMS (because they do not like the wording used under MBNMS) and rather it should be considered to have the exclusion area under GFNMS.

Superintendent of MBNMS, Paul Michel, expresses concern about the (false) notion that Monterey Bay Sanctuary doesn't support commercial fishermen.

# Motion to adopt resolution, as written

**First:** Bob Breen **Second:** Jaime Jhancke



**Vote:** 3 abstain, 2 opposed, rest are in favor

Kellyx can't support it until she sees an analysis, Clare seconds this position

**Emissions Inventory (Possible Council Action)** (Brian Johnson)Presentation Available at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/2011\_emissions\_inventory.pdf

# **Beach Watch Update** (Jan Roletto)

Presentation Available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12 08/beachwatch ppt.pdf

# Marine Debris Program (Kate Bimrose)

Presentation Available at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/12\_08/marine\_debris\_ppt.pdf

Adjourn: 4:15pm

# Attendance

NAME	SEAT	P/A
Dominique Richard	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma- Alt	A
Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	P
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	P
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	P
Clare O'Reilly	CA OPC Alternate	P
Richard Charter [Council Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Wilson [Council Secretary]	Conservation	P
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	A
Bob Breen	Education	P
Vacant	Education Alternate	
Barbara Emley [Council Vice-		
Chair]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
	Maritime Activities/Commercial	
Peter Grenell	Alternate	P
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	A
	Maritime Activities/Recreational	
George Clyde	Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	A
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	A
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	P
Vacant (John Bradley)	USFWS	P
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Bradley Soule	USCG	P



LTJG Noelle Kitenko	USCG Alternate	P
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	A
Natalie-Cosentino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	P
Kaitlin Graiff	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	P
Karen Grimmer	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A