



GREATER FARALLONES and CORDELL BANK
NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARIES
JOINT ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING

Red Barn Classroom, 1 Bear Valley Road
Point Reyes Station, CA 94956
Thursday, August 25, 2016

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the joint Sanctuary Advisory Council (SAC) meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS), Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS), or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

GFNMS SAC Members and Alternates Present:

Christy Walker, Dominique Richard, George Clyde, Richard Charter, Jackie Dragon, Bruce Bowser, Francesca Koe, Bibit Traut, Barbara Emley, John Berge, Joshua Russo, Abby Mohan, John Largier, Jaime Jahncke, Caleb Rosen, Oliver York, Cicely Muldoon, Jason Brand, Dan Howard

CBNMS Members and Alternates Present:

George Clyde (Chair; Community-at-Large – Marin County)
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin County Alt.)
Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large-Sonoma County)
Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County Alt.)
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)
Rachel Bergren (Education Alt.)
Richard Ogg (Fishing)
Noah Wagner (Fishing Alt.)
Kevin Krick (Maritime Activities)
John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)
Jaime Jahncke (Research)
Tessa Hill (Research Alt.)

CBNMS Agency Representatives and Alternates Present:

Maria Brown (GFNMS Superintendent)
Brian Johnson (GFNMS Alt.)
Dayna Matthews (NOAA Fisheries)
LCDR Jason Brand (United States Coast Guard)

Copies to:

Bill Douros, Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) West Coast Regional Office

Call to order 9:10AM

Review Agenda



Roll Call
Review Agenda
Swear-in new member (Oliver York: Youth Alternate)

GFNMS Superintendent's Report

Permits

A research permit was issued to John Largier to extend the expiration date for two years to continue to allow the servicing and cleaning of a mooring and buoy in Tomales Bay, which are used for the attachment of scientific equipment to collect meteorological and oceanographic data.

Dr. Bryant Hichwa with the Coastal Stewardship Task Force of the Sea Ranch Association applied for a permit to collect seabird data with a Phantom 3 unmanned aerial system (or drone) for the collection of photographs to continue long-term monitoring in this area and help determine nesting success at Black Point Islands and Galleons Islands. Applied, but no permit was required at this time.

A Superintendent's permit was issued to Drs. Nicole Raineault and Michael Brennan, Ocean Exploration Trust. A Letter of Authorization (LOA) was issued on June 20, 2016 to conduct deep-water habitat and shipwreck surveys in GFNMS, Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), and CBNMS with the E/V Nautilus. Two amendments were subsequently issued (on July 13 and Aug 4), which modified the anticipated dates of the surveys and what would be allowed under the collection activities.

A research permit was issued to Ms. Laura Elsberry, University of CA - Irvine for disturbances of the seabed during a research study entitled, "Abiotic and biotic factors influencing rockweed communities along the California rocky shore".

A research permit was issued to Dr. Bruce Mate, Oregon State University for discharges of up to two types of animal movement tags (non-retrievable) into the sanctuary from tagging and to conduct low overflights associated with the study entitled, "Blue and Fin Whale Tagging in Central and Northern California". A research permit in Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary (CINMS) was issued March 2016 for work in Southern California (CINMS-2016-002). Due to changes in oceanographic conditions associated with El Niño and other anomalous warming events, the majority of blue whales in Southern California are emaciated and cannot be tagged. Additional tagging was then proposed off the coasts of GFNMS, MBNMS, and CBNMS during a six- to eight- week period in the summer/fall of 2016 and 2017.

A research permit was submitted by Ms. Debra Shearwater, Shearwater Journeys requesting to conduct a research project to attract seabirds to a vessel through the use of their natural prey items: fish, squid, krill, and menhaden oil, to gather data regarding the numbers and locations of species present that will be document in eBird and to also document any observations of new species not historically encountered to increase knowledge and understanding of the resources of the national marine sanctuaries. *We are elevating the discussion to ONMS to consider the*

implications of the project from a national perspective. Meeting with ONMS on Sept 15.

Ms. Jane Reifert, Incredible Adventures, requested to 1) amend the title of the current two-year permit to "Adventures in White Shark Education: Dispelling the Myths" and to 2) use scent attractants. The applicant states she has only received 18 bookings for this season's white shark tours and is requesting the use of scent attractants. She proposes mitigation for the use of chum, including voluntarily capping the company's number of shark expeditions to 20 annually, (out of a potential 76 days currently allowed) and not use decoys on the days when scent attractant is used.

Dr. Barbara Block, Stanford University, has requested to extend the expiration date of current white shark tagging permit, "Ecology and Population Dynamics of White Sharks in the Northeastern Pacific and Associated Filming of the Research Activities".

GFNMS held a successful white shark naturalist training class on Saturday, August 13 at the Sanctuary office.

Richard Charter asked about the Shearwater permit and why it has been elevated to headquarters and questioned whether it is pure research or more tourism with a small component of research. Maria clarified we want to ensure we are being consistent across the system in regards to issuing research permits for attracting wildlife.

Vessel Groundings

Sailboat Grounding in Bodega Bay with Successful Outcome

A 26' sailing vessel ran aground on Doran Beach (Sonoma County) the evening of July 22 (Friday) after the anchor dragged in Bodega Bay. There was 15 gallons of spill potential. Its rudder was broken, but the boat was in good shape overall. On July 25, the vessel was successfully refloated by volunteers in the community and towed to a harbor.

Staff Transitions

Chris Kelley from Greater Farallones Association (GFA) has moved on. Francesca Koe and Bob Wilson, GFA board members, are co-directors at this time.

GFNMS had two summer interns from California State University, Council on Ocean Affairs, Science & Technology (COAST) working on a recreation and tourism and social media plan. The plan outlines efforts to reach out to recreation and tourism operators to give them the tools and resources to give to their clients and encourage ocean stewardship. GFNMS also had two summer interns working on the Golden Gate Biosphere Reserve application. We were designated over 20 years ago as A Man in a Biosphere Reserve, a United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) designation. We are now up for re-designation; our interns put together an 82-page report and presented it to the UNESCO team in Colorado last week.



ONMS Director position has been opened, they have selected a person that is currently in clearance (can take 2-3 months). We are expecting to hear who the new director is this fall.

Nautilus Cruise Update

Maria was out on the cruise this past weekend. Very exciting - ten new species for GFNMS were identified on the cruise! We are now exploring the USS Independence and will take samples to determine if the ship is still radioactive. UC Berkeley researchers are taking samples of the biota and will analyze. There was also an exploratory dive in Pioneer Canyon and will soon be heading to the Farallones Escarpment.

Research Symposium

The Beyond the Golden Gate Research Symposium will be held in December. It is a day of presentations by researchers studying the extraordinary marine life, oceanography and geology of the central San Francisco Bay, Gulf of the Farallones, Bodega Bay and Cordell Bank regions and adjacent waters between Point Arena and Point Año. The event will be December 1 from 9:00 AM to 6:00 PM and will include morning refreshments, lunch and an early evening reception and poster session. Presentations will focus on new, on-going and recently completed research, monitoring and habitat characterization projects. Presentations will be brief project summaries (8 minutes or less). We have scheduled long breaks so that participants have the opportunity to meet with presenters and to network with colleagues, resource managers, and decision makers.

Registration is open to everyone and costs \$25 (to cover lunch and refreshments). Space is limited so please register soon! There will not be hardcopy proceedings. Registrants should download a PDF copy of the proceedings prior to the Symposium, available online after 6:00 PM on November 21. Additional information can be found online at:

<http://www.sfbaynerr.org/goldengate2016>

Recently published in the Federal Register was a public notice of an unsolicited request for Outer Continental Shelf (OCS) wind lease – Trident Winds – wind energy development off the coast. Request for interest and request for public comment. Comment period is ending soon – September 19th.

Maritime Heritage Update

There was a successful expedition to the dog hole ports at Fort Ross. MJ and Brian have more information.

CBNMS Superintendent's Report

Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) update: GFNMS and CBNMS have completed two cruises this year. On the spring cruise, more whales were observed this spring

than any other year since we started the cruises in 2004. Conditions in southern California seem to be less productive than northern California which could explain high numbers of whales in our area. We will be monitoring post-blob conditions this year. Our next cruise is coming up in September.

This will be our third year measuring dissolved oxygen in sanctuary waters. We have two moorings out on Cordell Bank with oxygen sensors mounted on the bottom of the line and a series of temperature sensors mounted on the line from the surface to the bottom.

Ship Strike Update: CBNMS has access to Automated Information System (AIS) data – that allows tracking the speeds of vessels passing through GFNMS and CBNMS. At the end of 2015, we collated all the data from the Coast Guard and sent out over 100 letters with a table for each company that outlined number of trips, speed in the traffic lanes, and reminded them of speed reduction request. 2015 was the first year of the seasonal speed reduction request.

John Berge added that the companies might not be aware, since the advisories are going out to ships themselves and captains may not choose to listen unless they hear the mandate from higher-ups in the companies.

Dick Ogg and other fishermen's efforts have removed 200 derelict crab pots from GFNMS and CBNMS last year, which were collected after the crabbing season was over. The SeaDoc Society is setting up an exchange to sell these pots back to the fishermen.

On June 8, World Oceans Day, GFNMS, CBNMS, and Point Reyes National Seashore (PRNS) had the grand opening of the Ocean Exploration Center at the PRNS Lighthouse. The new visitor center is an extension of the existing visitor center. The lighthouse has about 400,000 visitors a year and the new exploration center will help engage with visitors and start conversations about ocean conservation.

The Park is celebrating their centennial today! As part of that there will be a potluck celebration right outside.

MBNMS Management Plan Review Update

Paul is out sick – Maria gave quick update:

At the last advisory council meeting, members volunteered for different working group subject areas. We have forwarded that along and you should be getting contacted. In terms of the Climate subject area, Sara Hutto was at their advisory council meetings last week and gave a climate change vulnerability assessment and adaptation training on Thursday for staff, and for the council on Friday. The other working groups have not gotten to subject areas in the Northern Management area so likely that is why you have not been contacted yet. Once you have, you are welcome to present to the council or bring back any information from the working group.

Richard Charter asked if there is any indication that they will be addressing the donut hole. Maria answered no.

Proposed United States Coast Guard Discharge Rule Update

Maria Brown and Dan Howard

Presentation available here: [View Presentation](#)

We have a revised estimated timeline: We had moved forward with boundary expansion with understanding that we would revisit this request from the Coast Guard. We have provided the Coast Guard for an exemption while we work through this project.

Completed scoping in May on the North Coast, which included three public meetings.

We are now developing draft for the environmental assessment with an estimated completion date of Fall/Winter 2016.

The next step will be revision and public comment in Winter/Spring 2017, and may be revised after that and estimate the final decision to occur by summer 2017.

Barbara Emley asked for clarification on the difference between Coast Guard requests to dump versus the cruise ships. Maria explained that the cruise ships now have the strictest discharge prohibition; since they are floating cities and the amount of waste surpass all other ships. The cruise ship industry has gone to tertiary treatment so the discharge is cleaner than water they take on the ship. Dan added that this issue with the Coast Guard came about with the expansion of the sanctuaries' boundaries; the Coast Guard is concerned because they cannot conduct normal operations. Prior to the expansion they were able to discharge in the that northern area. The environmental assessment will analyze the discharges from training and ammunition, discharge of sewage, etc., and present different alternatives such as no action (keeping regulation as is: no discharge allowed by the Coast Guard anywhere in the sanctuaries), and other alternatives.

Nomination of GFNMS, CBNMS, & MBNMS for UNESCO World Heritage Status (POTENTIAL ACTION ITEM)

Maria Brown and Dan Howard: Presentation available here: [View Presentation](#)

Francesca Koe asked for clarification on the previous designation and Man in the Biosphere versus World Heritage Status and whether this opens up new funding. Maria clarified that Man in the Biosphere Reserve is a UNESCO designation for sites that have significant ecological value. It looks at what countries are doing to protect that ecological value while allowing sustainable development (areas that have communities in and around and are involved in protecting). Our report says we have communities living adjacent to state parks, refuges, sanctuaries – where people fish, boat, and hike –and those communities are involved in protection and stewardship. One requirement is that we have zones of protection; we have outlined that state has provided marine reserves and national park wilderness areas with buffers of protection. These are simply designations, so no additional funding comes with the designation, but it can provide a status and language to be used. These statuses are important on the international level so the State Department is encouraging us to participate. Jackie adds she

would love to get a copy of the application report once it's complete.

Questions on presentation:

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook asked about increased tourism and whether there has been any assessment of how much this would increase and how to manage the additional visitation? Dan and Maria said they are not sure exactly how much it would, it may draw international tourists; this may not jump off the radar that much. Maria added that outdoor tourism is increasing in general which is why it is important to develop a sustainable tourism plan.

Barbara Emley asked if there are any downsides like additional paperwork and reports. Maria clarified that every 10 years there is additional paperwork, but otherwise not.

Dick Ogg asked if there would be any impact to the commercial fishing industry. It was clarified there are no additional regulations.

Richard Charter asserted this could be an extra layer of protection we may want going into the future (future threats might include ocean mining).

George Clyde drafted a letter of support of the nomination process. George noted that it is an important designation to have attached to our sanctuaries since it brings a new kind of attention. One of the struggles of Cordell Bank is this question of what is this designation and why is it important? It would be very valuable for CBNMS to get a different kind of recognition.

Motion: Richard Charter

Second: Jackie Dragon

Verbal Vote CBNMS Advisory Council: approved

Verbal Vote GFNMS Advisory Council: approved

BREAK

Hypoxia in the North-central California National Marine Sanctuaries: Monitoring Oxygen Levels in a New Climate

John Largier: Presentation available here: [View Presentation](#)

Josh Russo brought up the issue of responsible reporting and referenced an incident in 2014 when this project started - one of the scientists from Bodega Marine Lab was interviewed and featured on the front page of Press Democrat. It showed lots of dead crabs and said the huge dead zone along CA coast was a huge doom and gloom article. John Russo emphasized the importance of more objective journalism. John Largier agreed, and Tessa Hill added, that you can be a conservative communicator, yet you cannot control what the media is going to write, and sometimes our feedback is not accepted especially with local news agencies going for the headline rather than the conservative community.

Dani Lipski added this has been a wonderful partnership with Cordell and she is excited to see

some of the data written up. This is the exact kind of thing we want to monitor; we don't know if there is a problem or how big the problem would be, but this helps us figure it out and determine if there is anything we can do to address the issue.

Francesca Koe asked about the length of period with the lowest oxygen – what length of time is the of the most concern? John answered that it usually last for a few days or a week.

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook asked how much of the water gets transported into Tomales Bay. John Largier explained warm- cold water intrusion happens a few times a year, acidic and hypoxic, and take a few days to work its way in and could stick around for a bit longer.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Jessie Monzel from the Center for Biological Diversity spoke on the entanglement of whales and sea turtles and the important role the sanctuaries can play in addressing this growing problem. There are a steadily increasing number of whale entanglements. There is a working group that includes state, federal, and crab fishermen, working to reduce the risk of entanglements in crab gear. Their work is limited though as they are only working on whales that are involved in crab fisheries and there are other limiting factors such as lack of real-time information. The latter point is where the Sanctuaries can play an important role by helping monitor turtles during spring and summer and helping to survey and monitor where the whales are to better define hotspots and better inform management issues.

NOAA Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) Report

Dayna Matthews: Presentation available online: [View Presentation](#)

John Largier asked how the money is being managed from violations. Dave clarified that it is dependent on the statute we are dealing with; it goes to the specific agreed sanctuary for where the violation occurred.

Paul Ortiz, Senior Enforcement Attorney of the NOAA Office of General Counsel, Southwest Section, spoke about his role with NOAA. For 13 years, Paul worked off the waters of California and has lots of experience chasing down illegal foreign fishing boats. About 7-8 years ago NOAA hired someone in his position in Honolulu, so he is no longer the sole prosecutor for NOAA ONMS. The majority of his work is focused on fisheries and foreign fishing boats, Endangered Species Act (specifically salmon and steelhead issues), Marine Mammal Protection Act, Lacey Act (a key statute for prosecuting for trafficking of wildlife), and the National Marine Sanctuaries Act. In regards to the National Marine Sanctuaries Act; it is an effective statute with a maximum penalty of \$176,728. It is a strict liability statute; for the violations that do occur, they do not have to spend a lot of time looking at the mental state of the violator or why it occurred. The idea is there should be nationwide consistencies across the board.

JOINT MEETING ADJOURNED

The meeting adjourned at 12:28 PM.