



GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS) KEY MEETING OUTCOMES

The Red Barn
Point Reyes National Seashore
Point Reyes, CA
9:15 a.m. – 3:45 p.m.
Wednesday February 25, 2015

Note: The following notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

Copies to:

Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office
Meeting called to order at: 9:30

Review Agenda

Roll Call

John Largier: Thanks to Dominique and Richard for their service as chair/vice-chair on the SAC

GFNMS Superintendent's Report

Permits

A research permit was issued to Cheryl Strong of US Fish and Wildlife Service to conduct low overflights less than 1,000 feet above ground level (AGL) in order to conduct waterfowl and seabird surveys. Surveys will be conducted annually in late December or early January using a single engine aircraft and two observers. This work is conducted to support the Refuge's Management Plan monitoring goals and the Annual Mid-Winter Waterfowl Survey sponsored by the USFWS, which has been going for decades. The overflights will be conducted at various sites throughout the GFNMS (including the Farallones, Bodega Head, Point Reyes, and Bolinas Lagoon) from December 2014 to January 2019.

An authorization of a USCG Marine Event Permit was issued to Cartel Management, Inc to allow the use of 15 MPWC by the contest sponsors during the Titans of Mavericks 2015 Surf Contest for surf rescue, transport of competitors, and other event management tasks and the deployment of temporary buoys to demarcate the contest area during the 1-day event. The event may take place between January 1, 2015 and March 31, 2015.

A management permit was issued to Veronica Pearson and James Raives of Marin County Open Space District to continue to maintain two water intake/pump assemblies in Bolinas Lagoon as part of the ongoing Kent Island Restoration Project. This is a renewal of their previous permit. The 24-inch-in-diameter pump intakes were installed in 2012. The intake is equipped with a



perforated culvert wrapped with a fish screen and is used to provide saltwater for irrigating and removal of invasive vegetation on the island.

A research permit application was denied to Marcus Lehmann of Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory and UC Berkeley to temporarily deploy and anchor to the seabed a 4-meter by 10-meter, “wave carpet” platform to measure whether the device can successfully absorb wave energy to reduce erosion and potentially generate electricity. The structure was to be deployed off of Doran Beach in Bodega Bay at a water depth between 4 and 20 meters for 1-2 weeks. The request is being denied, because the applicant did not demonstrate the proposed activity would further research or monitoring related to sanctuary resources and qualities nor did the applicant show that the project needs to be conducted within the sanctuary. Further, erosion and wave energy are both natural processes necessary for healthy ocean ecosystems, so the end goal attempting to reduce these forces for 1-2 weeks would not benefit the sanctuary and the data collection over this short time-frame would not produce useful information adequate to assist with sanctuary management decisions.

A permit for salvage/recovery operations was issued to Charles Friend of Tomales Bay Oyster Company to remove two illegal fence structures from submerged lands at the mouth of Walker Creek, in Tomales Bay. One fence is approximately 760 feet long (located further offshore) and the other is approximately 143 feet long (located closer to the creek mouth).

A research permit is under review for Matt Robart and John Largier of UC Davis/Bodega Marine Lab to deploy 3-4 moorings and attached instrumentation within the GFNMS and northern portion of MBNMS to study how upwelling brings deep hypoxic and acidified ocean water through the Gulf and into San Francisco Bay. The aim of this project is to observe, quantify and understand the spatial extent, temporal duration, and degree of dilution of upwelled water intrusions into the Bay. The study will especially focus on analyzing intrusions of hypoxic and acidified waters. The moorings would be in place for up to 6 months and removed upon project completion.

A permit is under review for Grace Kato of State Lands Commission to authorize the California State Lands Commission to implement the Tomales Bay Vessel Mooring Program, which was established as part of the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan developed by GFNMS in partnership with State Lands. The program sets a limit of the number of moorings and includes specific criteria for mooring locations, required specifications for mooring tackle, and requirements for the inspection and maintenance of moorings. The permit would be good for 10 years to coincide with the CSLC's 10-year lease period.

Jane Reifert of Incredible Adventures filed an appeal on November 7, 2014 opposing NOAA's decision to not allow the use of scent attractants or chum under their education permit number GFNMS-2014-013 to attract white sharks for educational tours.

Save Our Seashore filed an appeal on December 17, 2014 opposing NOAA education permit number GFNMS-2014-013 issued to Incredible Adventures to attract white sharks for private charter tours.



Save Our Seashore filed an appeal on December 17, 2014 opposing NOAA education permit number GFNMS-2014-010 issued to Great White Adventures to attract white sharks for private charter tours.

Vessel Groundings

NO vessel groundings have occurred since the November SAC meeting.

“Mystery Goo” Seabird Event

A “mystery gray goo” is affecting birds, primarily in San Francisco Bay, since the third week of January. More than 300 coated birds have been captured and brought to wildlife rehabilitation centers; approximately 170 seabirds have died and the remaining birds are still undergoing treatment and waiting for release. Surf Scoters are the primary species being affected, as well as Horned Grebes, Scaups and Common Goldeneyes. Samples have been sent to multiple labs around the county in an effort to ID the substance since different labs have different chemical testing specialties. Thus far, the substance which looks like rubber cement has still not been exactly identified according the State (CDFW), but it has been determined the goo is not petroleum-based and it contains a mixture of animals fats and oils and synthetic oils. The source of the spill is also still unknown.

Introduced Species Update

The rule was published in the Federal Register on 2/19

<http://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/FR-2015-02-19/pdf/2015-03486.pdf>

Mavericks Surf Contest Update

As reported at the last SAC meeting, there is a new organization managing the event this year, Cartel Management, Inc. They have all their permits in hand and are just waiting for the waves. The contest window runs from January 1st to March 31st this year. Due to concerns that charter boats and other recreational craft have been getting too close to the surf break in past years, the USCG has developed an interim regulation for this year’s contest which allows them to restrict all vessel traffic within a larger radius around the surf break. The contest sponsors and agencies, including GFNMS, have also been concerned about increasing numbers of recreational aircraft and drones flying through the area each year and the increased safety risk and potential for wildlife disturbance. A request has been made to the FAA for a 1-day temporary flight restriction (TFR) but it is unlikely to be granted, since according the FAA TFRs are only issued for when an aviation or major sporting event could pose a hazard to non-participating aircraft in the area, such as an air show with high speed or aerobatic flight demonstrations.

The festival at the Oceano Hotel has also been canceled for this year. So, we have concerns that could mean more people trying to get a closer vantage-point and going to the shoreline (bluff) or out on the water. With no festival happening, the local agencies may be able to redeploy more staff to these areas for crowd control.

MBNMS Superintendent's Report

BBC Meetings – MBNMS, West Coast Region Office, and Channel Islands NMS spent time at the end of January working with the BBC and PBS planning shows on the amazing wildlife and habitats of the CA Central Coast. Shows to air (“live”) at end of August.

May Davidson Seamount Mission aboard the NOAA Ship Shimada -1) Bird and mammal surveys above and adjacent to the seamount; 2) Night time mid-water surveys of fishes; 3) Sampling for micro plastics; 4) Listening for mammals with a hydrophone; and 5) Some oceanographic sampling, including for environmental DNA

February Saturdays are “Ocean Movie Night” at Hearst Theatre – MBNMS has been partnering with SLO Business Improvement District to put on ocean movie nights at the Hearst Castle Theatre in San Simeon – Saturdays in Feb.. Featured movie is the BBC film “Ocean Giants”.

MBNMS to Initiate Management Plan Review-Update – The whole process from start to finish should take three years. The scope of the review is an update and regulatory changes, not a complete re-write. Year 1: Review/Analysis& Scoping; Year 2: Writing/Working Groups; Year 3: Finalizing. MBNMS anticipates the Working Group/staff writing process and the NEPA/regulatory work will take the most time. End of June/early July are public scoping meetings (Pillar Point early July). August joint MB-GF SAC meeting will be time for GFNMS Advisory Council input, MBNMS will share a synthesis report on scoping and an initial list of needed changes/amendments to plan.

Annual Sanctuary Currents Symposium - Please come to this year's annual science symposium, April 25 at CSUMB, this year's theme is Citizen Science.

Most Recent YourSanctuaryTV show, “Mysteries of the Deep” - Latest show features trip to Sur Ridge and a visit to the lost container! YouTube has a YourSanctuaryTV channel, and all content is download-able from archive.org. (just type in search for "your sanctuary"). latest episode:

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pAY1moqysbU>

Your Sanctuary TV - Travel and Tourism Show, Part 1

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y8K8JLMPEK4&index=52&list=PLUexXW5ZOwlLc7m99aeSIYM1EmQ4rtM7f>

Part 2

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mmVdr8Rm3Ps&list=PLUexXW5ZOwlLc7m99aeSIYM1EmQ4rtM7f&index=57>

Sanctuary Exploration Center – MBNMS is working on some exhibit enhancements and new exhibits, as well as some exterior and interior wall and window treatments. The upgrades will be implemented fall and winter 2015.



Water Quality Memorandum Of Agreement – MBNMS is circulating a revised and updated WQ MOA to the appropriate local, state, and federal agency partners for signatures. The MOA that describes the purposes and approaches to coordinated water quality management in MBNMS.

Recent (December) “lost container” study - Working with MBARI, we are studying organism recruitment on different types of container surfaces: standard container paint, new enviro-friendly paint, plain granite, and sandstone. We want to better understand how the standard container paint affects organism abundance and diversity on and around the container.

NMFS Enforcement Update

Presentation available at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/15_02/ole_ppt.pdf

Discussion: Elizabeth Babcock observed that financial penalties for violation of sanctuary regulations seem low. She asked that the SAC be informed the next time this pricing scheme is reviewed, so that the SAC may weigh-in to NOAA on these penalties.

BREAK

Expanded Sanctuary Name Recommendation (Action Item)

During the public hearings for the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary expansion, NOAA received public comment requesting the agency to consider new ecosystem-based names for the expanded sanctuary. In response the GFNMS Advisory Council established a subcommittee composed of the Research Seat, Conservation Seat, and Youth Seat to explore potential names for the expanded sanctuary and to develop a criteria for selecting a new name. A collaboration of marketing experts developed a list of potential names which was presented to the subcommittee. The subcommittee narrowed the list of 30 names to 3 names and presented the potential names and criteria to the Sanctuary Advisory Council on November 19, 2014. The Sanctuary Advisory Council was then tasked with speaking to each member's respective constituency group regarding the potential names. The Sanctuary Advisory Council members revisited the potential new names and recommended either keeping Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary because the name is familiar and represents the core of the ecosystem or changing the name to the Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary to indicate that the sanctuary has expanded. Farallones means in Spanish a rock or islet jutting out of the sea, a rock isolated from shore by the action of waves. A feature of the sanctuary and in particular the expanded area is assemblages of rocky outcrops offshore and along the coast. The name recommendation will be presented to the Director of the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries for a decision.

After much discussion and two rounds of voting, the council recommended two names to the Superintendent to be passed along to Washington DC:

Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (no change)



Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary

Both of the above names received 10 votes each from council members. No other suggested names received more than 3 votes.

Member Reports

Abby Mohan (Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate): Pass

Christy Walker (Community At-Large/ SF and San Mateo Alternate):

A new library is being built in Half Moon Bay. The County of San Mateo is funding \$10 million; we break ground in the summer of 2016. It might be a good opportunity for the sanctuary to partner or have a presence.

Gerry McChesney (USFWS Alternate)- The current ocean conditions can be gauged if you use Farallon seabirds as an indicator, e.g. through the Cassin's auklet die-off. Activity on the island has been very low, indicating that the birds are likely elsewhere. That might be an indicator of a bad breeding season coming up. The island has 7 Brown Boobies overwintering, which is very rare and further indication of the warming ocean conditions. It is also elephant seal breeding season. Elephant seals have been in decline at the islands over the last decade and a half because of eroding beach breeding habitat.

The Army Corps of Engineers is finalizing an Environmental Impact Statement to do major hazing and depredation of cormorants on the Columbia River to protect salmonids. USFWS, using aerial surveys, will monitor to see if that impacts the west coast.

USFWS has 2 mooring buoys with GFNMS at the Farallones. One was lost last winter and has not been replaced. USFWS is working with USCG at Yerba Buena Island to do that.

Bruce Bowser (Conservation Alternate) –

Jan 22nd was the State of the Lagoon meeting at the Stinson Beach Community Center. Over 100 people attended. GFNMS and County of Marin provided great presentations and a historic timeline as to how the lagoon has evolved. It was also an opportunity to introduce the members of the Bolinas Lagoon Advisory Council (BLAC) and that went well.

On Jan 31, Bruce interviewed on KWMR radio for his role in the State of the Lagoon meeting and involvement in the sanctuary, and what the sanctuary represents for locals. He also discussed his work on Duxbury reef.

On Feb 26, meeting with county and rocky shore naturalists and California Academy of Sciences will hammer out issues in regard to Duxbury Reef regulations and visitation. The County came up with new signs. The program will explain why the county has redone the parking lot, tidepool etiquette and phone numbers to report violations.



Jaime Jahncke (Research Alternate)-

Point Blue had a retreat at Stinson Beach to discuss challenges to seabird protection and a model to use along the coast. Also, there are scheduled activities at CAS every week or so to talk about krill, including Nightlife on April 16th. We might actually see brown boobies nest' on Farallon Islands.

George Clyde (Community At-Large Marin/Sonoma Alternate) -

George reported that theoretically, all of Tomales Bay is available to leasing. There are restrictions for navigation, eelgrass, etc., but new technologies are being developed. Pressure will increase to have more operations. One oysterman has applied to harvest algae off of his oyster beds. At a recent Fish and Game Commission they talked about what their role might be, and the CA Coastal Commission is involved as well. There is an effort to have a Programmatic Environmental Impact Report, so instead of a case by case, it would be a single cost for everybody. There is a lot of interest in enforcing and refining the clean-up obligations of oyster companies. There is lots of retail activity along Tomales Bay as well.

George also expressed concern that the wet storage and sales alongside Tomales Bay of non-local oysters from Washington, Mexico and elsewhere pose a risk to the Bay, since those imported oysters can carry introduced species that come as "hitch hikers" with the oysters. These risks includes possible discharge into Tomales Bay of contaminated water used for wet storage and the risk that retail customers along the shore may throw their oyster shells into the Bay or otherwise expose the Bay to the non-local oysters.

Pat Rutten (National Marine Fisheries Service Primary)-

Dr. Kathy Sullivan will be visiting California and wants to see the Russian River estuary. Also, NOAA is making some progress in getting full-scale restoration of Pescadero Creek.

Prop 1 water bonds will come out with a solicitation for \$10 million in July. The Restoration Center will be coming out with another \$10 million dollar funding opportunity for resiliency. NOAA is looking for input on a red abalone restoration plan. NOAA is also doing a lot with abalone-urchin barren removal and the reintroduction of white abalone in Southern California.

Dominique Richard (Community At-Large Marin/Sonoma Primary):

Dominique suggested that NOAA may want to consider revising the Tomales Bay Vessel Management Plan to address human-use issues in the bay.

Beach Watch is working on the Cassin's auklet die-off as well as a new system to identify the age of birds.

Barbara Emley (Maritime Activities/Commercial Primary):

Commercial fishing is in-between seasons: crab is slow, salmon starts in May, and herring never got off the ground due to a pricing discrepancy. The crabs were very small, though abundant in the Bay Area, but the opposite up north (good size, poor abundance). This is likely due to warm water.

Richard Charter (Conservation Primary):



Last week, Flower Garden Bank NMS in the Gulf of Mexico proposed a boundary expansion, but doing so will allow slant drilling underneath the marine sanctuary, which poses a threat of failure of the equipment, resulting in a spill. The public comment is still open, so please make a comment.

John Largier (Research Primary):

There is new work being published about upwelling intensification, with papers in Science and in Nature, and the idea is gaining credibility. The West Coast Ocean Acidification and Hypoxia Panel continues to meet with products being developed through 2015. UC Davis and CBNMS have deployed oxygen sensors in shelf waters and also in Tomales Bay and San Francisco Bay with the expectation of seeing hypoxic upwelling events again in 2015.

Lauren Garske (UC Davis graduate and Nancy Foster fellow) who worked with SAC on role of science, is now at the California Coastal Commission.

Elizabeth Babcock (Education Primary):

California Academy of Sciences (CAS) is hosting a Drone Conservation Conference on 9/17/2015. Also, CAS is opening a whale exhibit on 4/3/2015, looking at whales and whale issues, with a delegation coming in from New Zealand.

The CA State Dept. of Education is working on report that recommends partnerships that advance environmental literacy. CAS is participating in a regional environmental collaborative that aims to improve the quality of environmental education and provide trainings. The CA Next Generation Science Standards are not implemented yet, but the collaborative is in the process of creating the curricular framework to address overlap and discrepancies to teach kids environmental themes.

Caleb Rosen (Youth Primary):

The youth subcommittee held a conference call to discuss the idea of a “youth congress”. The idea received lots of good feedback. The idea is to bring together youth seats/programs from various programs and facilitate a discussion between them to educate each other on their respective programs and get them involved. The subcommittee developed a list of organizations and contacts to reach out to and create the youth congress. We also want to get these youth together coincidentally with a SAC meeting or a mock SAC meeting. A working group is recommended.

Cicely Muldoon (National Park Service Primary):

The cleanup and restoration of Drakes Estero is underway. The onshore commercial structures have been removed, and the planning for the removal of the 5 miles of oyster racks and affiliated marine debris and infrastructure is underway. We hope to begin the cleanup this calendar year. The annual harbor seal pupping season closure in Drakes Estero and the western end of Limantour Spit begins March 1 and remains in effect through June 30.

Public Comment

Laurie Manerick, West Marin Outdoors- There is an amazing influx of people into Tomales



Bay for recreation (kayaking, boating, etc). West Marin Outdoors is proposing that anyone that goes out on Tomales Bay needs to have a wag bag with them. So many people out there are not taking care of their own byproducts. This bag has no byproducts. They're easy to use and cost \$5. Anyone on the bay needs to have this item, but we need educational support; we don't have contact with fishermen, crabbers and the people coming out in small motorboats. Most boats on Tomales Bay do not have toilets. Most of the boats are going out of Miller Park and Marconi.

[John Largier suggests a broader-level agenda item we should talk about: human activity in Tomales Bay, to include public safety, environmental concerns, and other issues.]

Gordon Bennet – Save our Seashore

- 1) Shark permit- the public cannot appeal a permit until it has been issued. The only way we can learn about these permits are at these meetings. A great white shark permit was issued in August to include the timeframe of Sept. to Nov., and by the time the 30-day appeal period took place, the permit had expired. This method that has been set up to allow the public to appeal permits does not work. The Sanctuary should put permits issued on its website and then give the public a 30-day opportunity to appeal. It is a waste of time to have to read through all of these permits at the SAC meetings; they should be posted online.
- 2) Tomales Bay Oyster Company is a serial offender. They have tons of stuff all over the bay. They're in violation of their county permit, their coastal permit, and trespass on National Park land.
- 3) Mariculture rule- CA Department of Fish and Wildlife is not an effective oversight body for mariculture. Their regulations assume growers are using triploid stock, but there is actually no requirement, and enforcement is not in their leases. GFNMS should take steps to protect Tomales Bay from poor mariculture operations. DFW does not enforce clean up bonds and won't enforce its own regulations, so the Sanctuary should help. The Department of Health regulates recirculation systems, but only regulates inputs, not output.

Amy Trainer – Environmental Action Committee of West Marin

Ms. Trainer attended a Fish and Game Commission Meeting discussing commercial harvest of kelp and algae, and wants to comment on this issue. The lack of public comment ability during Fish and Game's Tomales Bay oyster lease sublease issuing is outrageous. The EAC testified at the hearing last week. Ms. Trainer wants to start a Tomales Baykeeper program to educate and protect the resources and educate the public. Also, related to spill responses, she put together a literature review of chemical dispersants used for oil spills showing that they are ineffective.

LUNCH

Advisory Council Business

Motion to approve GFNMS minutes from 11/2014 (**Action Item**)

Motioned: Richard Charter

Seconded: Dominique Richard



Aye: all
Nay: 0
Abstain: 0
Motion passes.

West Coast Region Quarterly

The WCR Quarterly can be viewed at: http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr_q4_2014.pdf

Selection Subcommittee

The council formed a subcommittee to review applications for open SAC seats: Conservation (Primary and Alternate), Maritime Activities/Commercial (Primary and Alternate) and Community At-Large SF/San Mateo (primary). Patrick Rutten, Dominique Richard, and Cicely Muldoon will review the incoming applications.

Youth Involvement Subcommittee Update

The council voted to create a working group (which may or may not have staff support) that would come up with recommendations on how to best engage youth in council process.

Caleb Rosen agreed to chair.

Motioned: Richard Charter

Second: Christy Walker

Approve: 9

No: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes.

Working group volunteers are: Christy Walker, Elizabeth Babcock, Richard Charter, Bibit Traut, Kellyx Nelson, August Howell

BREAK

Information Agenda Items:

Expansion

Presentation can be viewed at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/15_02/feis_ppt.pdf

US Coast Guard Sanctuary Support/Enforcement Activities

Presentation can be viewed at: http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/15_02/uscg_ppt.pdf

Final Climate Vulnerability Assessment

Presentation can be viewed at:

http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/15_02/adaptation_ppt.pdf

ADJOURN

Attendance



NAME	SEAT	P/A
Dominique Richard	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
George Clyde	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	P
Kellyx Nelson [Council Vice-Chair]	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	A
Christy Walker	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	P
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	A
Vacant	CA OPC Alternate	
Richard Charter	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Vacant	Conservation	
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	A
Elizabeth Babcock	Education	P
Bibit Traut	Education Alternate	A
Barbara Emley [Council Secretary]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
Vacant	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	
Joshua Russo	Maritime Activities/Recreational	A
Abby Mohan	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier [Council Chair]	Research	P
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Caleb Rosen	Youth Primary	P
August Howell	Youth Alternate	A
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	P
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	A
Anne Morkill	USFWS	A
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	P
LTCO Joe Giammanco	USCG	A
LT Shannon Anthony	USCG Alternate	P
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	P
Lisa Van Atta	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	A
Michael Carver	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A



Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	A
Dawn Hayes	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A