

## **GULF OF THE FARALLONES NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY (GFNMS) ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING**

PRNSA Building 70 (Morgan Ranch House)  
Point Reyes National Seashore  
Point Reyes, CA  
9:15 a.m. – 3:45 p.m.  
Wednesday, November 20<sup>th</sup>, 2013

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting and do not necessarily reflect the opinion or position of the Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary or the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration.

### **CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, REVIEW AGENDA**

#### ***Copies to:***

Bill Douros, ONMS West Coast Regional Office  
Meeting called to order at 9:30am

#### **Review Agenda**

Roll Call  
Swear-in New Council Members

#### **Superintendent's Report:**

##### ***Permits:***

A research permit was issued to Akana Noto from UCSD to remove cuttings of Salicornia pacifica (a native perennial herb) and non-S. pacifica species (as a control) to study the interactions between marsh plants and their local adaptation to environmental conditions and climate change. The permittee is authorized to install 36 wooden stakes with data loggers attached and remove up to 0.08 cubic feet of sediment for salinity testing. This will take place at the mouth of Walker Creek in Tomales Bay.

A research and education permit was issued to Barbara Block, Stanford University, for attracting white sharks for ongoing research purposes to better understand population abundance and trends, migration patterns, genetic structure, and essential habitat of white sharks along the Central CA coast. The permittee is authorized to deploy up to 35 acoustic tags and 10 satellite pop-up (PAT) tags, and collect up to 40 biopsy samples and 100 photo IDs. In addition, the permittee is also allowed to install and maintain two new moorings and receivers to detect and transmit data from acoustically tagged sharks: one at Piedras Blancas (within MBNMS) and one at Hopkins Marine Station (within MBNMS).

An education permit was issued to John Duba, of Silver Fox and Sportfishing tours for attracting white sharks for education purposes as part of ecotourism charters for the public at the Farallon islands.

An education permit was issued to Jane Reifert, of Incredible Adventures for attracting white sharks for education purposes as part of ecotourism charters for the public.

An education permit was issued to William Shepherd, of the Steinhart Aquarium, for collecting marine substrates (including rock with encrusting organisms and sand) to provide material for the Aquarium's new "Rocky Reef" exhibit (slated to open in June 2014) and to maintain existing exhibits. The permittee is allowed to collect up to 60 cubic meters (approximately 2,000 pounds) of material from intertidal and subtidal areas over a period of three years. Material will be collected from 9 different sites to minimize the loss of substrate from any one area.

A public event authorization was issued to Jessica Banks and Jeff Clark, of Mavericks Invitational for the use of 15 Motorized Personal Watercraft (MPWC) during the Body Glove Mavericks Invitational Presented by GoPro surf contest. These will be used for search and rescue, contestant transport, filming, and logistics. The permittee is also allowed to disturb the seabed to temporarily install a mooring and buoy during the contest to guide MPWC users to the competitor pickup location. As in previous seasons, the permit requires wildlife observers to be on-site during the contest and MPWC riders to be pre-approved and wearing recognizable jerseys and placards at all times.

*Budget:* At this time GFNMS is working with 10% of last year's budget

*Results of Emissions Audit:*

Total and per capita emissions in calendar year 2012 were the lowest since the site began measuring greenhouse gasses five years ago. Despite this downward trend, there are troubling details upon closer examination of the data. The demand for natural gas and electricity has essentially remained level year after year, with an increase observed when a new building was added to this survey in 2010. Together, these sources of energy contribute approximately 30% of the site's total emissions. Wastewater and solid waste have also remained steady since 2008, and continue to contribute less than 3% of the sites total emissions.

Transportation remains the highest portion of emissions, contributing nearly 70% of the site's total. Automobile transportation (commuting & government vehicles) makes up 75% of that, but has remained essentially unchanged since 2008. The only reason transportation emissions have decreased over the past few years is due to decreased air travel and at-sea research; both due to budget reductions. It is anticipated that these emissions would take an upward turn should discretionary travel and research funds become available.

*Seabird Protection Network Update:*

The Seabird protection Network is:

- Developing an online Wildlife Disturbance Reporting form (Google Forms), which will be piloted throughout the 2014 seabird breeding season, and will be refined and widely distributed the following year
- Working with San Mateo County - Public Works Department - Half Moon Bay Airport to install a touch-screen kiosk at 3-Zeros Cafe. The touch screen will include video of

nesting seabirds on Devil's Slide Rock, information on sanctuaries, sanctuary overflight information, etc.

- Potentially hosting a workshop in collaboration with San Mateo County Airports on the importance of flying seabird safe. The workshop will be a safety seminar and invitees will include local instructors and nearby association members.
- Coordinating an effort to propose Special Closures along the Central Coast Region.

*Essential Fish Habitat:*

As previously reported, GFNMS has been an active participant in The Pacific Fishery Management Council's Essential Fish Habitat review process as a member Essential Fish Habitat (EFH) Review Committee. GFNMS submitted a proposal to the Pacific Council for their consideration of options for EFH management measures, which include gear specific options and options for habitat designations. These options reflect a review of new information regarding three ecologically important habitat areas:

- Rittenburg Bank to Fanny Shoal;
- "Cochrane" Bank (unofficial name); and
- a portion of the Farallon Escarpment.

The Pacific Council was scheduled to review all the proposals at a November 6th Council meeting and decide whether or not to move to the next phase of the process, which includes developing an EIS. However there has been a slight modification to the process. Although the Pacific Council determined that there was sufficient new information to move forward and voted to go to the next phase of the EFH review process, which is called phase 3, the EFH Review Committee was unable to meet and finish their report due to the government shutdown.

Therefore the Council directed Council staff to work with the EFH Review Committee to complete the draft Phase 2 report in a streamlined manner, for a final report in March 2014.

The GFNMS proposal will be included in that final report. The Pacific Council will then determine the process for moving forward at the March meeting. In the interim, NMFS will be working to provide evaluation criteria and methods that can be used to evaluate the current EFH designations and will develop a schedule to formally scope issues for a fishery management plan amendment (and EIS).

**MBNMS Superintendent's Report**

MBNMS received a vessel traffic analysis for 2009-2012. The report looked at Automatic Identification System (AIS) data to see if ships comply with voluntary shipping lanes. Overall the ships are complying with the changes and updates. The southbound track is especially used by tankers with more hazardous materials according to random reviews.

**CBNMS Superintendent's Report**

Draft versions of revised management plan, environmental impact statement and proposed rule have been submitted to headquarters for review. GFNMS and CBNMS are on schedule for activities related to the proposed boundary expansion despite loss of furlough days.

Shutdown impacts for CBNMS –

Because NOAA R/V FULMAR was directed to immediately return to home port in Monterey, and eight government and contract staff were furloughed, CBNMS cancelled a cruise to assess deep corals, sponges and other invertebrates on and around Cordell Bank. Loss of this data will directly impact our ability to manage one of our nation's significant marine protected areas, loss of information related to Essential Fish Habitat protection, loss of data to establish bench marks for understanding impacts of climate change on offshore biological communities, and loss of education and outreach information to promote marine conservation. Contracts for four support staff will be modified or terminated resulting in loss of income. Contracts for preparing the remotely operated vehicle and testing all systems prior to the cruise were paid but work will not be completed. With budget constraints unclear if we will be able to reschedule this work in FY14.

The federal government closure resulted in a loss of 11 work days by CBNMS, GFNMS, West Coast Region, and ONMS staff on the Proposed CBNMS and GFNMS Boundary Expansion project, delaying the review, production and public release of the Notice of Proposed Rulemaking in the Federal Register, including the proposed changes to the regulations, proposed changes to the terms of designation, the Draft Environmental Impact Statement, and the draft revised management plans for CBNMS and GFNMS. In addition, there was a direct fiscal impact of the closure on the project budget. The DEIS contractor spent more hours working on DEIS content and formatting than had been anticipated before the closure, due to the fact that she had planned to work with NOAA project staff during that time to submit a review draft of the DEIS to ONMS headquarters during the first week of the shutdown, and had to do this work without the help of the NOAA project staff.

CBNMS missed an opportunity to network with educators at "Teachers Night at the Oakland Museum of California (OMCA)". Teachers were invited to meet with organizations represented in the museum exhibits, giving teachers an opportunity to connect with educational resources available through the museum partners. OMCA just opened the Natural Sciences Gallery in 2013 with a major exhibit focused on CBNMS, so this was a big miss for CBNMS to engage a new audience in a new area. Engaging teachers early in the year provides an opportunity to reach new audiences and promote marine stewardship and the importance of marine sanctuaries.

CBNMS was not able to host an ongoing professional development webinar for the Winged Ambassadors teachers that we trained this June, 2013. The webinar will be rescheduled, but the timing is now off, and will require more work to reset the calendar and find a time that works for teachers. With this delay, it is not certain that teachers will be able to implement the curriculum this school year if we are not able to reschedule in the next month.

Dani Lipski has joined CB staff as our research coordinator. Dani was previously the research specialist at Channel Islands NMS for several years and we are really excited to have Dani on board to lead our research team.

CBNMS completed second year of sampling to evaluate effects from recreational rockfish conservation areas that closed Cordell Bank and areas within the GFNMS to recreational fishing.

Two year project partnering with Sea Grant, CDF&W, NMFS Santa Cruz laboratory, and recreational charter boat operators and fisherment. Sampling was at Cordell Bank, adjacent to Farallon Islands and near Deep Reef out of Half Moon Bay.

## **BREAK**

### **Advisory Council Business**

*Approve Meeting Notes for May 2013*

Motion to approve the May 2013 minutes

Motion: Richard Charter

Second: Bruce Bowser

Opposed/Abstained: 8 favor; none opposed, 1 abstention

Vote: Motion Passed with noted edits

*Approve Joint and GFNMS-only Meeting Notes for August 2013*

Motion to approve the Joint Meeting Notes

Motion: Barbara Emley

Second: Richard Charter

Opposed/Abstained: 8 favor; 2 abstained

Vote: Motion Passed with noted edits

*WCR Quarterly Report*

Please see: [http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr\\_q3\\_2013.pdf](http://sanctuaries.noaa.gov/about/pdfs/wcr_q3_2013.pdf)

### **Member Reports**

Coast Guard: USCG is working on some collaboration with sanctuaries on enforcement. The USCG is experiencing 40% reduction in resource hours so we're working with the state and other branches to enforce sanctuary regulations.

Jackie Dragon: I have a report on the Rainbow Warrior; the ship is sailing down to Monterey Bay now. We hosted so many events in SF about our work and particularly did some local outreach on climate change. Last week we had a Greenpeace high donor event; we don't take any corporate or government money and we did really well from our private donors. We shared our work with them as well as the work of the sanctuaries so thanks for contributing. The Spotter Pro app and ship strikes were big to share as well so overall the event was a success.

George Clyde: ONMS has a new Sea to Shining Sea award: Jenny Stock won the award this year. Take some time to go to Oakland Museum to see the Cordell Bank exhibit.

Clare Waldmann: The Ocean Protection Council meeting in Sacramento tomorrow is slated to discuss fisheries and aquaculture. The PEIR is almost ready for public comment in December with a 90-day public comment to discuss proposed aquaculture projects. Following this we anticipate an inter-agency working group.

John Largier: We met with the Sonoma County Water Agency to discuss the Russian River

habitat blueprint, so we'll see what results come of that. There is a lot of ocean acidification work in Tomales Bay going on and determining the key players in that issue. The CA Shellfish Initiative is looking at the hindrances to shellfish. We now have real-time data from Tomales Bay from buoys and we are going to deploy another one to look at acidification. Last summer was an intense upwelling event and we're seeing hypoxic waters upwelling off of Bodega Bay which is really unusual. Mixing is occurring within SF Bay and Tomales Bay. There is formal MOA/panel scheduled between CA, OR, WA, BC to discuss ocean acidification and hypoxia.

Mick Menigoz: It was not a great shark viewing season, with visibility of less than 10 feet. We had maybe 5 feeding events all season, which is a low number. Rock cod season was excellent, with numbers we haven't seen in years, and crabs look good so far.

Barbara Emley: Here's some info on the exempted fishery permit: the SF Community Fishery Association is working with Ft. Bragg fishermen to get a permit that could avoid concern in rockfish fishery areas, particularly in regards to the yellow-eyed rockfish. Pacific Fisheries Management Council thinks it has a lot of potential and they are letting us go forward into 2015-2016 to figure out how this would work for a fishery. The goal is to open up some fishing and encourage new generations of commercial fishermen. Also, crab season just started, and so far they are plentiful and of a good size; we're not sure how long it will last; we have trap limits for boats but when you multiply that by the number of boats out there it's a lot. The limit is 500 pots per boat.

Jaime Jahncke: The last ACCESS cruise occurred during last week of September; we planned for that cruise to compare data with that of the Spotter Pro app. We had huge media coverage from Time, Washington Post, and others on the Spotter Pro app data. The cruise found lots of whales in the northern areas of our study, near CBNMS, and were able to send that information to shipping channels/USCG to notice to mariners to avoid strikes. Some of our papers will be published. It was a low shark season; there was a group of 13 orcas harassing sea lions seen from Southeast Farallon Island in October and November, so that could be related. We've also done some additional studies on salamanders.

Bruce Bowser: The Kent Island/Bolinas Lagoon and saltwater irrigation ceased for the season; we've irrigated about a 1/3 of the island, and we feel it's going to be successful on the invasive species. Fortunately, the Duxbury Reef parking lot just resurfaced/resloped before the first rains. The sea star die offs are a big concern and we're trying to find a cause. On 12/7 the first MPA Watch and training will occur. Last Thursday I did my last tsunami debris survey and did not find anything of significance; the mapping shows lots of debris out there so we're waiting for it to come ashore.

Richard Charter: Sally Jewell's visit up north went really well; she spoke about fracking issues. It's important to have Secretary of the Interior on the Mendocino Coast, as residents want the sanctuary expansion to include Mendocino County. Sally is making really important decisions on marine areas and she was really interested in the expansion. She's under pressure as Congress is debating whether federal lands should be leased each year for drilling or not. Also a thank-you to Jackie for the Greenpeace gathering; it was a great donor event and overall very

successful.

Ann Morkill: We have a recovery plan for tidal marsh areas; here is the link:  
[http://www.fws.gov/sacramento/es/Recovery-Planning/Tidal-Marsh/es\\_recovery\\_tidal-marsh-recovery.htm](http://www.fws.gov/sacramento/es/Recovery-Planning/Tidal-Marsh/es_recovery_tidal-marsh-recovery.htm)

Dominique Richard: Beach Watch had an event/training last week, and it went really well and showed off our positive relationship with CA Academy and Exploratorium. The Christmas Bird Count is coming up and we need a team to participate.

### **Public Comment**

Kelle Kacmarcik, Wildlife Solutions/Advocacy at WildCare: I'm here to speak on mouse eradication. We had 3012 signatures opposing the plans, and we currently oppose the draft EIS and urge you to do the same and support the alternative. We agree the mice are a problem but air-dropping loads of toxins onto the islands are not a sound solution. All of the options rely on poisons that could affect seabirds dramatically, so we need to come up with other sustainable methods. We're concerned with known/unknown risks.

Maggie Sergio: I've been involved in pesticides for a long time and became aware of the SEFI rodenticide plan. I don't support this and embrace "do-no-harm" and ask you to consider alternatives to air-dropping the chemicals as other bird species will suffer as well. There is a profound lack of data.

Eleanor Lyman: I am very opposed to the rodenticide plan, and I'm not reassured by the EIS. The weather and ocean cannot be controlled so we can't predict how the entry into the oceans of these chemicals will affect the ecosystem. These pellets will sink down on the ocean floor, and this is just not a good plan as bioaccumulation will occur.

Ellen Holmes: Please reject the rat poisons; we need to think about the unintended consequences as we don't know enough about these chemicals. We could try a gentler friendlier approach to eradication.

Sonce Devries: I'm ex-Fish and Wildlife Service; I was the acting pesticide person for the USFWS. In that time I was asked to review/comment on rodenticides, so I'm familiar with this issue. The EIS for SEFI is not a good solution, and seabirds will suffer greatly from this; it's not necessary action. It's more important to notice what is not said in the EIS, especially as many more birds than usual will be present on the islands at the same time of year as the drops.

Amy Trainer: We need to be very cautious about this mouse eradication, and I urge you to oppose this proposal. As Bruce mentioned, MPA Watch program in Marin is holding a training in a few weeks [amy@eacmarin.org](mailto:amy@eacmarin.org) to get more information on the training; I also wanted to comment on SW Environmental Response management Application (ERMA), saying CA needs an updated oil spill response. The chemical dispersants are not proven effective so we need to stop using them as their efficacy is low.

Superintendent Maria Brown offered one clarification: The GFNMS Advisory Council does not approve the Environmental Assessment of the mouse eradication project, as the action is under the control of a separate government department (USFWS). The ERMA was taken off the agenda and it doesn't include dispersants; it's about creating a database of where ships are/what habitats could be affected by oil spills.

## LUNCH

### **Ocean Climate Initiative**

Please see the two presentations on this topic at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_11/climate\\_smart\\_indicators.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_11/climate_smart_indicators.pdf) and

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_11/ocof\\_demo\\_ppt.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_11/ocof_demo_ppt.pdf)

Read the Working group report at: <http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/climate/pdf/GFNMS-Indicators-Monitoring-Plan-FINAL.pdf>

## BREAK

### **Mouse Eradication at SE Farallon Island**

1) Ann Morkill's (USFWS) presentation is available at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_11/usfws\\_sefi.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_11/usfws_sefi.pdf)

2) Susan Kegley's (Pesticide Research Institute) presentation is available at:

[http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_11/kegley\\_sefi.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_11/kegley_sefi.pdf)

Lengthy discussion on this issue followed. Ultimately, the SAC passed a resolution.

Motion to adopt the resolution

Motion: Barbara Emley

Second: John Largier

Opposed/Abstained: 5 approved, 0 opposed, 2 abstained

Vote: passed

The resolution is available at: [http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13\\_11/sefi\\_reso.pdf](http://farallones.noaa.gov/manage/pdf/sac/13_11/sefi_reso.pdf)

## ADJOURN

Attendance

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SEAT</b>	<b>P/A</b>
Dominique Richard [Council Chair]	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma	P
Richard Kuehn	Public-At-Large Marin/Sonoma-Alt	A
Kellyx Nelson	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo	P
Tim Duff	Public At-Large SF/San Mateo Alternate	A
Catherine Kuhlman	CA Ocean Protection Council	A
Clare O'Reilly	CA OPC Alternate	P
Richard Charter [Council Vice-Chair]	Conservation	P
Bruce Bowser	Conservation Alternate	P
Bob Wilson	Conservation	A
Jackie Dragon	Conservation Alternate	A
Vacant	Education	
Vacant	Education Alternate	
Barbara Emley [Council Secretary]	Maritime Activities/ Commercial	P
Peter Grenell	Maritime Activities/Commercial Alternate	P
Mick Menigoz	Maritime Activities/Recreational	P
George Clyde	Maritime Activities/Recreational Alternate	P
John Largier	Research	P
Jaime Jahncke	Research Alternate	P
Cicely Muldoon	National Park Service	P
Frank Dean	National Park Service Alternate	A
Anne Morkill	USFWS	P
Gerry McChesney	USFWS Alternate	A
LT Cody Dunagan	USCG	P
LT Helen Crump	USCG Alternate	P
Pat Rutten	NMFS [non-voting]	A
Natalie-Constantino Manning	NMFS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Maria Brown	GFNMS [non-voting]	P
Chris Mobley	CINMS [non-voting]	A
Mike Murray	CINMS Alternate [non-voting]	A
Dan Howard	CBNMS [non-voting]	P
Michael Carver	CBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	P
Paul Michel	MBNMS [non-voting]	A
Karen Grimmer	MBNMS Alternate [non-voting]	A